



# CIVIC IMPACT FRAMEWORK

Prepared by: Meredith Davis

**GOOD**  
**ROOTS**

Good Roots Consulting

**20**  
opera.ca

# Contents

---

Contents .....	2
Introduction .....	1
Framework Objectives.....	3
Overarching Impact Questions.....	4
Civic Impact Theme Areas .....	5
Experience.....	6
Access .....	6
Education .....	7
Community.....	8
Truth and Reconciliation .....	9
Overview of Data Collection Tools .....	11
Ethical Considerations.....	12
Data Analysis .....	13
Dissemination of Results .....	14
<b>Appendix A</b> Sample Data Collection Tools .....	15
Post-Performance Survey.....	16
Child and Youth Paper Evaluation .....	18
Online Teacher Evaluation.....	19
DIY Opera Participant Survey .....	20
Partnership Reflection Guide .....	21
<b>Appendix B</b> Opera.ca Civic Impact Logic Model .....	22
<b>Appendix C</b> Resources Consulted .....	26
Key Informants .....	27
Civic Impact Advisory Committee Members.....	27
Written Sources.....	28

# Introduction

---

Opera.ca is the national association for opera in Canada, presently representing sixteen member companies that belong to Opera.ca, ranging from large companies such as Toronto's Canadian Opera Company and Vancouver Opera to smaller companies like Opera on the Avalon, Saskatoon Opera and Against the Grain Theatre in Toronto. Each of these companies plays a pivotal role in their respective region's cultural context. Opera.ca members also include opera-related businesses, teaching institutions and individuals employed in or with interests in opera.

Opera companies across Canada are engaged in a host of civic impact activities that go beyond the important offering of staging high-quality, full-length opera productions. Opera.ca member companies bring opera out into the community for the enjoyment of individuals such as seniors and parents with small children who face barriers to attending a full-length opera. They offer arts-based learning opportunities for kids and youth in schools, after-school programs and camps which build core competencies such as creativity, collaboration, communication and critical thinking. They work with marginalized populations such as youth living with mental health issues or individuals experiencing homelessness to co-create original operas that give people a voice to tell their own stories. They work in collaboration with Indigenous partners and artists to bring Indigenous stories to life through opera in the spirit of truth and reconciliation.

Good Roots Consulting was hired by Opera.ca to develop a civic impact framework that would allow its member companies across Canada to better understand and articulate the difference that these activities are making in the lives of individuals and in their communities more widely.

The framework was developed based on information gleaned through conversations with Opera.ca's Executive Director; an in-person group workshop with representatives from member companies at the 2018 Opera.ca Annual General Meeting; telephone interviews with representatives from 11 Opera.ca member companies; a review of relevant literature relating to civic impact in the arts; and feedback provided by Civic Impact Advisory Committee members on a draft framework and tools. Also, Pacific Opera Victoria, Manitoba Opera and Opéra de Montréal generously shared their own civic impact measurement frameworks and associated tools, which we drew on for inspiration around indicators and survey questions.

This document outlines the key elements of the civic impact framework, including:

- Framework objectives and overarching impact questions that the framework seeks to answer;
- Civic impact themes and associated activities, outcomes and indicators;
- Data collection tools; and,
- Suggestions for data analysis and dissemination of findings.

Full data collection tools examples can be found in **Appendix A**; a program logic model which guided the creation of the framework in **Appendix B**; and a list of resources consulted in the development of this framework in **Appendix C**.

# Framework Objectives

---

The framework is aimed at capturing useful data in an ongoing and flexible way that will support the opera sector's commitment to creating strong and positive civic impact across Canada. The framework is meant to be adapted over time in response to evolving civic practice of the member companies and Opera.ca.

The objectives of the civic impact framework project are as follows:

- To strengthen evaluative capacity in the opera sector.
- To support evidence-based decision making and better align intent with impact.
- To provide a common language and structure for measuring impact.
- To better tell the story of the impact of opera in Canada beyond the numbers.
- To address the misconception surrounding opera as an elitist artform.
- To take a 360° approach that considers how all stakeholders (opera companies, artists, partner organizations, program participants and the artform itself) are changed through civic impact work. (emerging)
- To explore digital platforms that would create a common approach to civic impact data collection and reporting so as to align opera's civic impact with that of non-arts and/or social partners. (emerging)

# Overarching Impact Questions

---

The civic impact framework has been developed to answer the following questions:

- To what extent and in what ways do opera companies across Canada contribute to positive civic impact in the communities in which they create?
- What specific aspects of opera's civic impact activities contribute most significantly to particular outcomes?
- How can Canadian opera companies further strengthen their civic impact work in order to bring about desired outcomes?

---

# Civic Impact Theme Areas

---

We identified five major civic impact theme areas under which the various civic impact activities carried out by member companies and associated outcomes can be presented: **EXPERIENCE**, **ACCESS**, **EDUCATION**, **COMMUNITY**, and **TRUTH & RECONCILIATION**.



# Experience

**Description:** Opera is a multidisciplinary art form that combines universal stories, drama, the unamplified human voice and music, which can result in a powerful sensory and emotional experience and new ways of experiencing and engaging with the world.

**Core Activities:**

- Stage high-quality, full-length opera productions and chamber operas

**Key Outcomes and Indicators:**

- Enjoyment: Overall enjoyment of the opera experience
- Captivation: Attendees report being entirely captivated at times by the opera experience
- Catharsis: Attendees report the opera experience unlocking strong emotions
- Cognitive growth: Attendees report seeing the world in a different way during and after the opera experience as well as a deeper understanding of the art form

**Suggested Data Collection Tool:** Post-performance survey

# Access

**Description:** Opera is financially, physically, cognitively and emotionally accessible to community members through the reduction of barriers and creation of multiple entry points.

**Core Activities:**

- Provide free or discounted tickets to performances, often through community partners
- Offer relaxed performances where a calmer sensory experience is provided and a more casual environment is created where normal rules don't apply (e.g. to sit quietly in a dark theatre)
- Provide opportunities for students to experience live opera performances
- Bring opera out of the theatre and into the community



***Key Outcomes and Indicators:***

- Exposure: Exposure to a new artistic/cultural experience that would have been inaccessible otherwise
- Comfort: Increased comfort while enjoying an artistic/cultural experience
- Belonging: Increased sense of belonging created by a warm, open and inviting atmosphere
- Conversion: Change in feeling towards opera
- Interest: Desire to experience opera again

***Suggested Data Collection Tool:*** Post-performance survey



***Description:*** Opera-based educational activities lead to positive outcomes such as the development of core competencies like creativity, collaboration, communication and critical thinking for children and youth and contribute to life-long learning for adults.

***Core Activities:***

- Provide educational programming to children and youth in schools and learning tools/resources for teachers
- Offer in-school opera intensives, after school programs and summer camps for children and youth to learn about and create their own works
- Provide programs to families with young children
- Provide opportunities for students to experience live opera performances
- Host pre-show opera talks for patrons and the broader community

***Key Outcomes and Indicators:***

- Engagement: Children and youth report looking forward to the program
- Core competencies: Demonstrated development of core competencies including creativity, communication, collaboration and critical thinking among children and youth
- Connections: Children and youth report feeling more connected to their classmates and/or fellow participants since being in the program
- Pride: Children and youth report feeling proud of their achievements in the program
- Appreciation: Patrons report they are better able to appreciate the opera as a result of attending a pre-show talk

**Suggested Data Collection Tools:** Child and youth paper evaluation; teacher online evaluation; post-performance survey



**Description:** Opera is a tool to build community by contributing to a stronger sense of empathy, appreciation for difference and a greater sense of belonging.

**Core Activities:**

- Develop original operas that are pertinent to the time and/or the region
- Organize thematic events surrounding a production, often in partnership with other community organizations that provide additional context
- Use opera to give communities an opportunity to engage in creative practice and a voice to tell their own stories, including marginalized populations (e.g. individuals experiencing homelessness or mental health issues)

**Key Outcomes and Indicators:**

- Relevance: People report an increased recognition that opera is more relevant to today than they had originally thought
- Pride: Increased sense of pride in one's culture or pride of place as a result of attendance/participation
- Empathy: Increased understanding of different people and cultures
- Cohesion: Disparate groups report having shared a common experience
- Belonging: Attendees report feeling an increased sense of community belonging
- Motivation: Attendees report drawing inspiration from the opera experience to engage in dialogue or action about a topic that was covered
- Confidence: Perceived increases in self-confidence for participants
- Self-expression: Perceived increases in ability to express oneself in a new way through opera
- Skills development: Observed and reported strengthening of artistic skills
- Mental health and well-being: Perceived improvements in mental health and well-being during program participation

**Suggested Data Collection Tools:** Post-performance survey; partner reflection guide; DIY opera participant survey

# Truth and Reconciliation

**Description:** Opera has the ability to participate in truth and reconciliation between Indigenous and settler communities by participating in Indigenous-led collaborative projects and co-producing works that contribute to the truth and reconciliation process.

**NOTE:** Through consultation with an Indigenous advisory group on this impact area, we now move away from reflecting opera-led core activities to *Indigenous-led guidance* for opera companies as the sector contemplates participation in the truth and reconciliation process. This is an important shift as one of the key themes of this guidance is to allow ourselves to be led in this process. It is strongly advised that this guidance be further refined in various member contexts by their own local Indigenous groups.

We thank and acknowledge the leadership of the Indigenous advisory group that shared this guidance: Marion Newman, Carey Newman, Ellen Newman, Gordan Gerrard and Dylan Robinson.

## ***Indigenous-led Guidance on Engaging in the Truth and Reconciliation Process Through Opera:***

- Invite Indigenous board members to help lead the organization and establish a meaningful balance of input from the Indigenous community
- Establish an Indigenous Advisory Council made up of local Indigenous community members, and through this process:
  - Be led in establishing relationships with the local Indigenous community, elders and knowledge keepers
  - Bring concerns, questions and advice-seeking to the council
  - Actively listen to and integrate their recommendations
  - Be led in learning how the organization can be supportive of Indigenous life in the area
  - Provide adequate compensation
- Work in collaboration with Indigenous partners and artists to establish boundaries and ways of working that create an environment in which Indigenous partners feel respected and safe, not simply like tokens to further an agenda, and ensure collaboration is Indigenous-led
- Share successes and recognize that successes never come without mistakes, so allow for these mistakes to become constructive by listening and learning from them
- Train staff and board members in cultural humility: humility is paramount because even with an open mind and the absolute best of intentions, implicit bias will mean that some regular processes

which a company may take for granted as standard professional practice may be counter to the goals and needs of the project and conflict with the perspective or values of the First Nation community you are working with

- Embed place-based protocols traditions (e.g. land acknowledgements): find out what would be most meaningful to Indigenous people in the local community and follow what they would prefer
- Co-create new operas, remaining aware of what stories are being told and finding ways to bring up that Indigenous peoples are still here and living, as all humans do
- Design and deliver programming and community initiatives that are inclusive of Indigenous ways of knowing around topics identified and approved by Indigenous partners and Indigenous Advisory Council
- Understand and adhere to local Indigenous protocols around knowledge sharing, data collection and data ownership
- Create a process for checking in with those who are performing these stories, both Indigenous and non-Indigenous and provide the necessary support

***Key Outcomes and Indicators:***

- Cultural humility: Increased understanding and celebration of local Indigenous culture and history and recognition of the wrongs that have been committed towards Indigenous peoples of Canada since colonization
- Authenticity: Extent to which Indigenous audience members/participants felt there was an authentic connection between the performance or programming and their own cultural heritage
- Integrity: Extent to which the performance or programming was Indigenous-led and artists and stakeholders have explored issues of power, privilege and potential for appropriation within the process of making the work
- Awareness: Participants identify activities as acts of truth and reconciliation, whereby truths are confronted and accepted and lead to increased participation in bringing about structural changes that include recognizing Indigenous world views and making space by ceding and sharing power and control within the creative process
- Agency: Extent to which people affected by the work have agency to act on their own behalf
- Reciprocity: Indigenous partners feel adequately compensated for participation in creative activities and as Advisory Council members, etc.

***Suggested Data Collection Tools:*** To be developed in collaboration with local Indigenous partners, but might include post-performance surveys, partner reflection guides, and talking circles. As stated in the activities above, it is important to understand and adhere to local Indigenous protocols around knowledge sharing, data collection and data ownership.

---

# Overview of Data Collection Tools

---

We propose the following data collection tools to answer the overarching impact questions and have provided sample tools in **Appendix A**. These tools are not exhaustive and do not adequately address each of the indicators listed above. There are many more tools that can and will be developed going forward by and with the sector.

## Post-Performance Survey

An online survey administered to performance attendees in the days following a performance with an incentive offered to encourage a high response rate such as a draw to win two free tickets to a performance of their choice.

## Child and Youth Paper Evaluation

A short paper survey delivered to children and youth participants in a program that gets at their favourite parts of the program, things they would change and the difference that the program has made for them.

## Online Teacher Evaluation

A brief online survey delivered to teachers in a school-based intensive program that asks them to share their observations about student engagement and demonstration of core competencies, as well as what was most valuable about the program for the class overall and suggestions for improvement.

## DIY Opera Participant Survey

A paper or online survey provided to participants on the last day of the opera program to learn about outcomes for participants, program strengths and areas for improvement.

## Partnership Reflection Guide

A verbal or written reflection guide for partner organizations using a set of guiding questions to explore strengths of the partnership, areas for improvement and the impact of the partnership for each organization and their various constituents. Whether this is done in dialogue collaboratively or separately and then shared in writing would depend on the level of trust and honesty already established in the relationship. Ideally, a somewhat neutral third party could facilitate the discussion.

## Other

The current emphasis of the tools shared in this civic impact framework is on audience members, program participants and community partners. Additional tools to be considered in the future to understand the outcomes of involvement in civic impact work for a wider variety of stakeholders might include: a survey for performers/artists; a survey for staff and/or Board members; a survey for volunteers; resources on talking circles; video testimonials; and observational methods.

# Ethical Considerations

---

Data collection tools have been designed and should be delivered with the privacy and well-being of respondents at the forefront of our consideration. The following are some of the practices that should guide development and implementation of data collection tools:

- **Ensure relevance:** Include key stakeholders in the process of developing and testing data collection methods to ensure appropriateness and refine as needed based on feedback received and changing informational needs.
- **Respect privacy:** Clearly communicate the purpose of any data collection tool to target respondents, how privacy of data will be ensured and how results will be used.
- **Minimize risks:** Reduce any risks to the respondent (e.g. refrain from asking questions that might upset somebody).
- **Reduce barriers:** Reduce barriers to participation (e.g. use plain language in survey introductions and questions).
- **Report back:** Report back to respondents in an accessible and interesting manner with a summary of results and how those results will be used to strengthen civic impact activities and/or support organizational efforts.

# Data Analysis

---

It will be the responsibility of individual Opera.ca member companies to administer data collection tools and analyze their own data.

Data analysis for the tools will differ depending on the types of questions:

***Closed questions:*** Closed questions (e.g., yes/no or Likert scales) will be summarized using counts, percentages, ranges, averages and other simple statistics to provide quantitative data that can be used to demonstrate impact through numbers. This data should be visualized in appropriate ways for ease of digestion (e.g., bar charts, histograms, pie charts).

***Open-ended questions:*** Qualitative data yielded through open-ended questions will be analyzed by identifying common themes as well as outliers that emerge from responses. This analysis can be done in Excel by adding a new column beside the data question being analyzed and writing the themes beside, or by printing out the data and colour coding using different coloured highlighters. Themes can then be translated into quantitative data by counting the number of times each theme is discussed. Quotes will also be presented to provide a richer picture of the various ideas communicated through the surveys.

Opera.ca is currently exploring partnerships with impact software companies for suitable platforms that could be used by member companies to track their own civic impact and for Opera.ca to ladder these individual member impacts up into a national story of the civic impact of the opera sector across Canada. Ideally this tool would make data collection, analysis and reporting a more streamlined process.

Until such an integrated solution is developed, SurveyMonkey is an affordable and user-friendly tool for administering online surveys and aiding in analysis. As discussed above, for qualitative data analysis or quantitative analysis that SurveyMonkey does not perform, data can be exported to Excel for easy manipulation, coding, etc. We recommend first saving a full data file and then a second working data file that you will manipulate for analysis to avoid losing data. If a paper survey is administered or verbal interviews conducted, the results can be transcribed directly into Excel for analysis.

# Dissemination of Results

---

Once results are analyzed, the hard but crucial part is to put them to work. To ensure the results don't just sit on a shelf, it is important to summarize and communicate the results in thoughtful ways depending on each audience. It can also be helpful for organizations to hold dedicated staff or Board meetings to digest the results and reflect on how they can be used to further strengthen civic impact activities.

Member organizations will be responsible for disseminating their own results in the format of their choosing. They have also committed to share a few key results with Opera.ca regarding agreed-upon collective indicators. Opera.ca can summarize those collective results in the following ways:

- An annual collective impact report (or every 2 years) including key numbers, outcomes indicator data, and case studies of impactful activities taking place on the ground by member companies.
- A collective impact summary which would be 1-2 pages and graphically designed for ease of digestion.
- Social media posts on key findings.
- A power point presentation on the collective civic impact results for sharing with relevant stakeholders along with a facilitated discussion around the utility of the results and further implications for work.



# Appendix A

## Sample Data Collection Tools

---

# Post-Performance Survey

## *Survey introduction:*

We want to hear from you!

Please take 10 minutes to respond to this survey about your recent experience attending a performance by [Opera company name here].

We are offering all respondents the chance to enter their name into a draw to win two tickets to a [Opera company name] performance of your choice. There is a space at the end of the survey for you to provide your contact information.

The results from the survey will be compiled and presented as a summary report. Your name or contact information will not be associated with any of your responses. However, quotes from responses might be included word for word in the report. So please keep that in mind when you are responding.

## *Questions:*

1. Was this your first time attending an opera performance by [Opera company name]? (Yes, No)
2. Did you receive free or discounted tickets to this performance? (Yes, No)
  - *If yes to 2:* Please share the degree to which you agree with the following statements:
    - The free/discounted tickets gave me the opportunity to access a cultural experience I would otherwise not have been able to. (Strongly agree, Agree, Neutral, Disagree, Strongly disagree)
    - I would come to something like this again. (Strongly agree, Agree, Neutral, Disagree, Strongly disagree)
  - *If yes to 2:* Did the performance change the way you feel about opera? (Very much, Somewhat, No)
    - *If Very much or Somewhat:*
      - **Before** attending this performance, what is one word you would have used to describe opera?
      - **Now** since attending this performance, what is one word you would use to describe opera?
  - *If no to 2:*
    - Approximately how many performances by [Opera company name] have you attended in the past? (2-4, 5-9, 10-14, 15-19, 20+)
    - And approximately how many of those performances were in the past year?
3. How would you rate your overall enjoyment of the opera experience? (I enjoyed it very much. I enjoyed it somewhat. I did not enjoy it very much. I did not enjoy it at all.)
4. What did you enjoy the most about your opera experience?
5. What would have made your opera experience more enjoyable?
6. *Relaxed performances:* Would you have felt comfortable attending a regular performance of this production? (Yes, Somewhat, No)

Please share the degree to which you agree with the following statements:

7. At times, I was entirely captivated by the opera experience. (Strongly agree, Agree, Neutral, Disagree, Strongly disagree)
8. I experienced strong emotional reactions during the opera experience. (Strongly agree, Agree, Neutral, Disagree, Strongly disagree)
9. The performance gave me a new understanding for people who are different from me, or for a culture other than my own. (Strongly agree, Agree, Neutral, Disagree, Strongly disagree)
10. The performance motivated me to engage in dialogue or action about a topic that was covered. (Strongly agree, Agree, Neutral, Disagree, Strongly disagree)
11. I feel more connected to my local community after seeing that performance. (Strongly agree, Agree, Neutral, Disagree, Strongly disagree)
12. During and/or upon leaving the theatre, how were you impacted by the opera experience and what was it exactly about the experience that made you feel that way? Please share as much detail as you'd like.
13. Is there anything else you'd like to share with us?
14. Thank you for taking the time to share your thoughts with us! Your feedback is very important to us. If you would like to be entered into a draw to win two tickets to a [Opera company name] of your choice, please provide your contact information below. We will not use this information for any other purposes besides the draw.
  - Name:
  - Email address:

# Child and Youth Paper Evaluation

## *Survey introduction:*

We need your help to make this program even better!

Please take a few minutes to answer a few questions about the [PROGRAM NAME]. Your ideas will help us make this program even better for other groups who are in it after you.

We are not asking for your name. We hope you will feel comfortable being honest about what you liked the best, what you didn't like as much and your experience being in the program.

## *Questions:*

*Circle the answer that you agree with the most.*

1. I felt excited on the days that we had the opera program. (A lot, A little, Not at all)
2. I feel proud of myself when I think of what I did in this program. (A lot, A little, Not at all)
3. When you think of what you have done in this program, what are you most proud of?
4. *School programs:* I feel more connected to the other kids in my class since doing the opera program. (A lot, A little, Not at all)
5. *After school programs/camps:* Did you make new friends in the opera program/camp? (Yes, No)
6. What is one thing you learned during this program?
7. What was your favourite part about the program?
8. If you were in charge of this program, what would you change about it to make it even better?

# Online Teacher Evaluation

## *Survey introduction:*

We need your insights in order to strengthen this program!

Please take a few minutes to answer a few questions about the [PROGRAM NAME]. Your observations and reflections are crucial so we can continue to strengthen the program for subsequent groups.

This survey is being conducted in the spirit of learning, from successes and failures. We hope you will feel comfortable being honest about what you liked the best about the program, what you noticed among your students and what aspects of the program we could improve upon.

Many thanks.

## *Questions:*

*Please select the answer that best represents your observations/experiences during the program and then provide more explanation and detail in the text box provided.*

1. Engagement: I noticed certain students in the class showing greater interest in the activity at hand and getting more involved than usual during the [Program Name]. (Strongly agree, Agree, Neutral, Disagree, Strongly Disagree)
  - Do you have any anecdotes you can share (without identifying specific students by name or other identifying information) to illustrate your response?
2. Creativity: The [Program Name] provided my students with a unique opportunity to be creative that they do not normally receive in a regular school day. (Strongly agree, Agree, Neutral, Disagree, Strongly Disagree)
  - Please share any relevant observations/thoughts to illustrate your response.
3. Collaboration: The [Program Name] provided my students with a unique opportunity to collaborate with one another that they do not normally receive in a regular school day. (Strongly agree, Agree, Neutral, Disagree, Strongly Disagree)
  - Please share any relevant observations/thoughts to illustrate your response.
4. Critical thinking: The [Program Name] provided my students with a unique opportunity to practice their critical thinking skills on a tangible project. (Strongly agree, Agree, Neutral, Disagree, Strongly Disagree)
  - Please share any relevant observations/thoughts to illustrate your response.
5. Communication: The [Program Name] provided my students with a unique opportunity to express their thoughts and ideas. (Strongly agree, Agree, Neutral, Disagree, Strongly Disagree)
  - Please share any relevant observations/thoughts to illustrate your response.
6. Overall, what was the most valuable about participating in [Program Name] for your class?
7. Please provide three suggestions for how we can improve this program.

# DIY Opera Participant Survey

## *Survey introduction:*

We need your help to make this program even better!

Please take a few minutes to answer a few questions about the [PROGRAM NAME]. Your ideas will help us make this program even better for other groups who are in it after you.

We are not asking for your name. We hope you will feel comfortable being honest about what you liked the best, what you didn't like as much and your experience being in the program.

The results from the survey will be compiled and presented as a summary report. Your name will not be associated with any of your responses. However, quotes from responses might be included word for word in the report. So please keep that in mind when you are responding.

## *Questions:*

Choose the answer that you agree with the most.

1. I feel more confident in my abilities as a result of participating in this program. (Strongly agree, Agree, Neutral, Disagree, Strongly Disagree)
2. I have learned new skills or improved skills I already had in this program. (Strongly agree, Agree, Neutral, Disagree, Strongly Disagree)
3. I have been able to express my thoughts, experiences and/or emotions in a new way through opera. (Strongly agree, Agree, Neutral, Disagree, Strongly Disagree)
4. Did participating in this program have an effect on your mental health and well-being? (Very much, Somewhat, No, Don't know)
  - *If Very much or Somewhat:* Please explain how this program affected your mental health and well-being.
5. What is the most important thing you learned about yourself during this program?
6. What is one new skills or piece of information that you learned in this program?
7. When you think of what you have done in this program, what are you most proud of?
8. What was the most important difference that attending this program has made for you? And what was it exactly about the program that contributed to that change?
9. What was your favourite part about the program?
10. Please provide three suggestions for how we can improve this program.

# Partnership Reflection Guide

## *Introduction:*

The purpose of this reflection guide is to allow us to reflect on our partnership together: what we have achieved, what has worked really well, where we could strengthen our collaboration and our ideas for moving forward to continue to maximize our collective impact in our community.

## *Questions:*

1. What have we accomplished together over the past year?
2. What has been most enjoyable about working together?
3. What has been more challenging?
4. What about this partnership should we keep doing?
5. What can we change to work even more effectively together?
6. Looking forward to a year from now, what do we hope to have accomplished?
7. What concrete steps do we need to take to get there? Let's keep this pretty high level for now so we don't get bogged down in the nitty-gritty details.

# Appendix B

## Opera.ca Civic Impact Logic Model

---



<b>Themes and Objectives:</b> <i>Civic impact themes &amp; a statement of what we are trying to achieve related to each</i>	<b>Activities:</b> <i>What we do to contribute to desired changes</i>	<b>Outputs:</b> <i>Information we will monitor along the way to tell us about the level of our civic impact activities</i>	<b>Outcomes &amp; Indicators:</b> <i>How we hope our target groups will be different as a result of their engagement with opera &amp; clues that will tell us if we are achieving our intended impact</i>	<b>Data Collection Tool:</b> <i>How we plan to gather the information</i>	<b>Relevance:</b> <i>What the current thinking is about why this is important</i>
<p><b>EXPERIENCE:</b></p> <p>To create a powerful sensory and emotional experience through opera that results in new ways of experiencing and engaging with the world.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Stage high-quality, full-length opera productions and chamber operas</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• # of full productions staged per year</li> <li>• # of chamber operas staged per year</li> <li>• # of recitals/concerts</li> <li>• # of original works developed per year</li> <li>• # of performances</li> <li>• # of audience members</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Enjoyment:</b> Overall enjoyment of the opera experience</li> <li>• <b>Captivation:</b> Attendees report being entirely captivated at times by the opera experience</li> <li>• <b>Catharsis:</b> Attendees report the opera experience unlocking strong emotions</li> <li>• <b>Cognitive growth:</b> Attendees report seeing the world in a different way during and after the opera experience as well as a deeper understanding of the art form</li> </ul>	<p>Post-performance survey</p>	<p>The arts offer intrinsic benefits to individuals, thereby enriching people's lives. A deep sense of satisfaction or pleasure can result from experiencing a more intense and meaningful version of reality through art than actual lived experience. A response of captivation to a work of art can move the individual out of the everyday into a state of focused attention which can open them up to new ways of seeing and experiencing the world. (RAND, 2004)</p> <p>Vivid sensations and strong emotional reactions deepen the experience of a creative work and the power of its civic message to motivate action around social issues. (Americans for the Arts, Aesthetic Perspectives)</p>
<p><b>ACCESS:</b></p> <p>To make opera financially, physically, cognitively and emotionally accessible to community members through the reduction of barriers and creation of multiple entry points.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Provide free or discounted tickets to performances, often through community partners</li> <li>• Offer relaxed performances where a calmer sensory experience is provided and a more casual environment is created where normal rules don't apply (e.g. to sit quietly in a dark theatre)</li> <li>• Provide opportunities for students to experience live opera performance</li> <li>• Bring opera out of the theatre and into the community</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• # of free tickets shared</li> <li>• # of discounted tickets sold</li> <li>• dollar value subsidized</li> <li>• # of community partners with a social mission</li> <li>• # of relaxed performances offered and # of attendees</li> <li>• # of free community engagement events outside the theatre and approximate # of people engaged</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Exposure:</b> Exposure to a new artistic/cultural experience that would have been inaccessible otherwise</li> <li>• <b>Comfort:</b> Increased comfort while enjoying an artistic/cultural experience</li> <li>• <b>Belonging:</b> Increased sense of belonging created by a warm, open and inviting atmosphere</li> <li>• <b>Conversion:</b> Change in feeling towards opera</li> <li>• <b>Interest:</b> Desire to experience opera again</li> </ul>	<p>Post-performance survey</p>	<p>A major determinant of attendance at live performing events is previous attendance. Previous cultural exposure is a more significant factor than sociodemographic factors such as income and education. Therefore, it is important to facilitate access to positive arts experiences to increase appreciation and peak interest in future attendance. (Hill Strategies, 2012)</p> <p>Established arts organizations that collaborate with a range of arts and non-arts organizations such as schools, churches and social organizations are important institutions for a community's cultural vitality. They encourage diverse cultural participation and a strong network of community stakeholders invested in community-engaged arts. (The Urban Institute, 2006)</p>

<b>Themes and Objectives:</b> <i>Civic impact themes &amp; a statement of what we are trying to achieve related to each</i>	<b>Activities:</b> <i>What we do to contribute to desired changes</i>	<b>Outputs:</b> <i>Information we will monitor along the way to tell us about the level of our civic impact activities</i>	<b>Outcomes &amp; Indicators:</b> <i>How we hope our target groups will be different as a result of their engagement with opera &amp; clues that will tell us if we are achieving our intended impact</i>	<b>Data Collection Tool:</b> <i>How we plan to gather the information</i>	<b>Relevance:</b> <i>What the current thinking is about why this is important</i>
<p><b>EDUCATION:</b></p> <p>To provide opera-based educational activities that lead to positive outcomes such as development of core competencies like creativity, collaboration, communication and critical thinking for children and youth and contribute to life-long learning for adults.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Provide educational programming to children and youth in schools and learning tools/resources for teachers</li> <li>• Offer in-school intensives, after school programs and summer camps for children and youth where children learn about and often create their own opera</li> <li>• Provide programs to families with young children</li> <li>• Host pre-show opera talks for patrons and the broader community</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• # of participating schools</li> <li>• # of learning tools/resources created</li> <li>• # of school visits</li> <li>• # of program sessions</li> <li>• # of children, youth and families engaged</li> <li>• # of pre-show talks</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Engagement:</b> Teachers report noticing certain students being more engaged during opera program sessions than in other classes and students report looking forward to the program</li> <li>• <b>Core competencies:</b> Demonstrated development of core competencies including creativity, communication, collaboration and critical thinking</li> <li>• <b>Connections:</b> Youth report feeling more connected to their classmates and/or fellow participants since being in the program</li> <li>• <b>Pride:</b> Youth report feeling proud of their achievements in the program</li> <li>• <b>Appreciation:</b> Patrons report they are better able to appreciate the opera as a result of attending a pre-show talk</li> </ul>	<p>Child and youth paper evaluation; online teacher evaluation; post-performance survey</p>	<p>Longitudinal studies demonstrate that students who have participated in arts-rich experiences have greater engagement in extracurricular activities and their communities more broadly (e.g. voting, volunteering). High school students from lower socio-economic backgrounds with arts-rich experiences participated in student government and school clubs four times more than students of similar backgrounds who had not had the same experiences. (Catteral, et al, 2012)</p> <p>Arts-based learning opportunities can also help to develop core learning competencies that will enable youth to face complex challenges of the 21<sup>st</sup> century, such as creativity, collaboration, communication and critical thinking. (Arts Victoria, 2011; People for Education; Government of Ontario, 2016)</p>
<p><b>COMMUNITY:</b></p> <p>To use opera as a tool to build community by contributing to a stronger sense of empathy, appreciation for difference and a greater sense of belonging.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Develop original operas that are pertinent to the time and/or the region</li> <li>• Organize thematic events surrounding a production, often in partnership with other community organizations that provide additional context</li> <li>• Use opera to give communities the opportunity to engage in creative practice and a voice to tell their own stories, including marginalized populations (e.g. individuals experiencing homelessness or mental health issues)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• # of community partner organizations</li> <li>• # of audience members/participants engaged</li> <li>• # of participatory operas co-created</li> <li>• # of co-creators/participants</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Relevance:</b> People recognize that opera is more relevant to today than they had originally thought</li> <li>• <b>Pride:</b> Increased sense of pride in one's culture or pride of place as a result of attendance/participation</li> <li>• <b>Empathy:</b> increased understanding of different people and cultures</li> <li>• <b>Cohesion:</b> Disparate groups report having shared a common experience</li> <li>• <b>Belonging:</b> Attendees report feeling an increased sense of community belonging</li> <li>• <b>Motivation:</b> Attendees report drawing inspiration from the opera experience to engage in dialogue or action about a topic that was covered</li> <li>• <b>Confidence:</b> Perceived increases in self-confidence by participants</li> <li>• <b>Skills development:</b> Strengthening of artistic skills</li> <li>• <b>Self-expression:</b> Ability to express oneself in a new way through opera</li> <li>• <b>Mental health and well-being:</b> Perceived improvements in mental health and well-being during program participation</li> </ul>	<p>Post-performance survey; partner reflection guide; DIY opera participant survey</p>	<p>The arts expand individual capacity for empathy by bringing people into the experience of others who are from different cultures or backgrounds from themselves, which over time can make people feel more accepting of different people, beliefs and cultures. (RAND)</p> <p>Social bonds are strengthened when people discuss and/or communally experience a work of art. (RAND)</p> <p>77% of Canadians agree or strongly agree that arts experiences help them feel part of their local community. (Phoenix Strategic Perspectives, 2012)</p> <p>Research by Montreal neuroscientist and musician Daniel J. Levitin at McGill University has proven that music has the capacity to positively affect memory and promote mental health. (Petri, 2012)</p>

<b>Themes and Objectives:</b> <i>Civic impact themes &amp; a statement of what we are trying to achieve related to each</i>	<b>Indigenous-Led Guidance on Activities:</b> <i>What we can do to contribute to desired changes</i>	<b>Outputs:</b> <i>Information we will monitor along the way to tell us about the level of our civic impact activities</i>	<b>Outcomes &amp; Indicators:</b> <i>How we hope our target groups will be different as a result of their engagement with opera &amp; clues that will tell us if we are achieving our intended impact</i>	<b>Data Collection Tool:</b> <i>How we plan to gather the information</i>	<b>Relevance:</b> <i>What the current thinking is about why this is important</i>
<p><b><u>TRUTH &amp; RECONCILIATION:</u></b></p> <p>To participate in reconciliation between Indigenous and settler communities by participating in Indigenous-led collaborative projects and co-producing works that contribute to the truth and reconciliation process.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Invite Indigenous board members to help lead the organization and establish a meaningful balance of input from the Indigenous community</li> <li>• Establish an Indigenous Advisory Council made up of local Indigenous community members</li> <li>• Work in collaboration with Indigenous partners and artists to establish boundaries and ways of working that create a respectful and safe environment and ensure collaboration is Indigenous-led</li> <li>• Share and learn from successes and mistakes</li> <li>• Train staff and board members in cultural humility</li> <li>• Embed place-based protocols traditions</li> <li>• Co-create new operas, remaining aware of what stories are being told</li> <li>• Design and deliver programming and community initiatives that are inclusive of Indigenous ways of knowing around topics identified and approved by Indigenous partners &amp; Advisory Council</li> <li>• Understand and adhere to local Indigenous protocols around knowledge sharing, data collection and data ownership</li> <li>• Create a process for checking in with all who are performing and provide the necessary support</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• # of Indigenous Advisory Councils</li> <li>• # of community partner organizations that are Indigenous-led</li> <li>• # of audience members/participants engaged through Indigenous programming, including % who identify as Indigenous</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Cultural humility:</b> Increased understanding and celebration of local Indigenous culture and history and recognition of the wrongs that have been committed towards Indigenous peoples of Canada since colonization</li> <li>• <b>Authenticity:</b> Extent to which Indigenous audience members/participants felt there was an authentic connection between the performance or programming and their own cultural heritage</li> <li>• <b>Integrity:</b> Extent to which the performance or programming was Indigenous-led and artists and stakeholders have explored issues of power, privilege and potential for appropriation within the process of making the work</li> <li>• <b>Awareness:</b> Participants identify activities as acts of truth and reconciliation, whereby truths are confronted and accepted and lead to increased participation in bringing about structural changes that include recognizing Indigenous world views and making space by ceding and sharing power and control within the creative process</li> <li>• <b>Agency:</b> Extent to which people affected by the work have agency to act on their own behalf</li> <li>• <b>Reciprocity:</b> Indigenous partners feel adequately compensated for participation in creative activities and as Advisory Council members, etc.</li> </ul>	<p>To be developed in collaboration with Indigenous partners, but might include a post-performance survey, partner reflection guide, or talking circles</p>	<p>"As the TRC has experienced in every region of the country, creative expression can play a vital role in this national reconciliation, providing alternative voices, vehicles, and venues for expressing historical truths and present hopes. Creative expression supports everyday practices of resistance, healing, and commemoration at individual, community, regional, and national levels. ... The arts help to restore human dignity and identity in the face of injustice. Properly structured, they can also invite people to explore their own worldviews, values, beliefs, and attitudes that may be barriers to healing, justice, and reconciliation. ... Art can be powerful and provocative. Through their work, Indigenous artists seek to resist and challenge the cultural understandings of settler-dominated versions of Canada's past and its present reality." (Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada, 178 - 180)</p>

# Appendix C

## Resources Consulted

---

## Key Informants

Patrick Corrigan, General Director, Opéra de Montréal  
Larry Desrochers, General Director, Manitoba Opera  
Kim Gaynor, General Director, Vancouver Opera  
Grégoire Legendre, General and Artistic Director, Opéra de Québec  
Jonathan MacArthur, General Manager, Against the Grain Theatre  
Cameron MacRae, Director of Marketing and Communications, Edmonton Opera  
Michael Mori, General Director, Tapestry Opera  
Amy Mushinski, Associate Director, Public Affairs, Canadian Opera Company  
Karen Reynaud, Executive Director, Saskatoon Opera  
Ian Rye, Chief Executive Officer, Pacific Opera Victoria  
Katherine Semcesen, Associate Director, Education and Outreach, Canadian Opera Company  
Pierre Vachon, Director, Community Engagement and Education, Opéra de Montréal  
Robin Whiffen, General Manager, Opera on the Avalon  
Tim Yakimec, General Director, Edmonton Opera

## Civic Impact Advisory Committee Members

Rebecca Hass, Director of Community Engagement, Pacific Opera Victoria  
Cameron MacRae, Director of Marketing and Communications, Edmonton Opera  
Colleen Maybin, Director of Education and Community Engagement, Vancouver Opera  
Pierre Vachon, Director, Community Engagement and Education, Opéra de Montréal

## Indigenous Advisory Group

Marion Newman, mezzo-soprano, Opera.ca board member  
Carey Newman, Kwagiulth/Stō:lo Artist  
Ellen Newman, Kwagiulth/Stō:lo/Haida BSW  
Gordan Gerrard, Conductor and Music Director, Regina Symphony Orchestra  
Dylan Robinson, Assistant Professor, Canada Research Chair in Indigenous Arts, Queens University

## Written Sources

- Americans for the Arts. (2017). Aesthetic Perspectives: Attributes of Excellence in Arts for Change. <https://www.americansforthearts.org/sites/default/files/Aesthetic%20Perspectives%20Full%20Framework.pdf>
- Arts Victoria. (2011). Partnerships Between Schools and the Professional Arts Sector: Evaluation of Impact on Student Outcomes. [https://creative.vic.gov.au/\\_data/assets/pdf\\_file/0004/56722/ARVI\\_Edu\\_Report\\_Web\\_FA-2.pdf](https://creative.vic.gov.au/_data/assets/pdf_file/0004/56722/ARVI_Edu_Report_Web_FA-2.pdf)
- Barto, L.D. & Civic Action Group. Civic Practice. National Opera Center America. <https://www.operaamerica.org/content/about/CivicPractice/files/intro.pdf>
- Catterall, J. S., Dumais, S. A., & Hampden-Thompson, G. (2012). The Arts and Achievement in At-Risk Youth, Findings from Four Longitudinal Studies. Washington: National Endowment for the Arts. <https://www.issuelab.org/resources/15711/15711.pdf>
- Cohe, G.D. (2006). The Creativity and Aging Study: The Impact of Professionally Conducted Cultural Programs on Older Adults, Final Report. [https://hsrc.himmelfarb.gwu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1001&context=son\\_ncafapubs](https://hsrc.himmelfarb.gwu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1001&context=son_ncafapubs)
- Community Foundations of Canada & Capacoa. (2016). Vital Signs: Arts and Belonging. <https://drive.google.com/file/d/0BwruWbbu9v7MY2NSbGxMaGJnWUk/view>
- Department of Canadian Heritage. (2016). Social Impacts and Benefits of Arts and Culture: A Literature Review. [http://publications.gc.ca/collections/collection\\_2018/pch/CH4-187-2016-eng.pdf](http://publications.gc.ca/collections/collection_2018/pch/CH4-187-2016-eng.pdf)
- Government of Ontario. (2016). 21st Century Competencies: Foundation Document for Discussion. [http://www.edugains.ca/resources21CL/About21stCentury/21CL\\_21stCenturyCompetencies.pdf](http://www.edugains.ca/resources21CL/About21stCentury/21CL_21stCenturyCompetencies.pdf)
- Hill Strategies. (2012). Factors in Canadians' Arts Attendance in 2010. Hamilton. <http://www.hillstrategies.com/content/factors-canadians%E2%80%99-artsattendance-2010>
- Jackson, M., Kabwasa-Green, F. & Herranz, J. (2006). Cultural Vitality in Communities: Interpretation and Indicators, The Urban Institute. <https://www.urban.org/sites/default/files/publication/50676/311392-Cultural-Vitality-in-Communities-Interpretation-and-Indicators.PDF>
- McCarthy, K. et al. (2004). Gifts of the Muse: Reframing the Debate About the Benefits of the Arts, RAND Corporation (Research in the Arts), Commissioned by The Wallace Foundation. [https://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/monographs/2005/RAND\\_MG218.pdf](https://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/monographs/2005/RAND_MG218.pdf)
- Nanos for Ontario Arts Council. (2017) Impressions of the impact of the arts on quality of life and well-being in Ontario. Ontario Arts Council Survey Findings: Executive Summary. [http://www.arts.on.ca/oac/media/oac/Publications/Research%20Reports%20EN-FR/Social%20Impacts%20of%20the%20Arts/Quality-of-Life-and-Well-Being-Exec-Summary\\_Final\\_EN\\_Accessible.pdf](http://www.arts.on.ca/oac/media/oac/Publications/Research%20Reports%20EN-FR/Social%20Impacts%20of%20the%20Arts/Quality-of-Life-and-Well-Being-Exec-Summary_Final_EN_Accessible.pdf)

Nestruck, J.K. (26 February 2016). Sensory friendly performances relax rules to welcome people with autism. The Globe and Mail. <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/arts/theatre-and-performance/relaxed-theatre-aims-to-create-welcoming-environment-for-people-with-autism/article28905503/>

Pacific Opera Victoria. Intrinsic Impact Framework.

Petri, I. (2012). Literature Review on the Value and Benefits of Performing Arts Presentation. Strategic Moves. [https://capacoa.ca/valueofpresentingdoc/LiteratureReview\\_Value\\_Update\\_2012.pdf](https://capacoa.ca/valueofpresentingdoc/LiteratureReview_Value_Update_2012.pdf)

Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada. (2015). Canada's Residential Schools: Reconciliation. The Final Report of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada, Volume 6. [http://trc.ca/assets/pdf/Honouring\\_the\\_Truth\\_Reconciling\\_for\\_the\\_Future\\_July\\_23\\_2015.pdf](http://trc.ca/assets/pdf/Honouring_the_Truth_Reconciling_for_the_Future_July_23_2015.pdf)